

Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century

By Craig M White
Version 1.7

"A nation [or Church] that forgets its past has no future" (Winston Churchill)

After the passing of the Apostles, did the Church of God consistently adhere to all of the original doctrines?
Where doctrines changed? Did error creep in or were they always doctrinally pure?



Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century

Authored by Craig Martin White.

Copyright © Craig Martin White, GPO Box 864, Sydney, Australia 2001.

All Rights Reserved.

This work is promoted through History Research Foundation (USA), History Research Projects (Australia) and Friends of the Sabbath (Australia)

www.friendsofsabbath.org

No part of this work may be edited. It may be freely shared as part of research, projects or for educational purposes as long as quotes are properly cited.

Contents

Contents.....	3
Introductory Remarks	5
Chart. Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century	6
Concluding Remarks	12
References and Additional Reading	14
Endnotes	16

History Research Projects

GPO Box 864, Sydney, Australia 2001

www.friendsofsabbath.org

www.hwalibrary.org

No limitation is placed upon reproduction of this document except that it must be reproduced in its entirety without modification or deletions. The publisher's name and address, copyright notice and this message must be included. It may be freely distributed but must be distributed without charge to the recipient.

Our purpose and desire is to foster Biblical, historical and related studies that strengthen the Church of God's message & mission and provides further support to its traditional doctrinal positions.

Other articles and charts in this series:

- *Amazing Temple Symbolism found in Revelation chapter 3!*
- *Collection of Notes on Church of God Groups*
- *Greenberry George Rupert. A Significant Church of God Leader*
- *Greenberry George Rupert. Man of God*
- *Herbert W Armstrong. Man of God*
- *Herman L Hoeh. Salute to a WCG Pioneer*
- *Historic Church of God Fundamentals of Belief. Tracking the Development of Core Doctrines*
- *History of the Fair Chance Doctrine*
- *Holy Day observances since the First Century*
- *Just what do you mean 'Laodicean Church'?*
- *Pioneers of the Worldwide Church of God*
- *Research Notes on the Eastern Churches*
- *Sabbatarian Groups: A scattered and little flock*
- *Seven Eras of Ancient Israel. Type of the Eras of the True Church?*
- *Seven Restorations of the Work*
- *Seventh Day Baptist Relationship to the Church of God*
- *The Doctrinal Heritage of the Church of God since the Nineteenth Century*
- *The Independent Sabbatarian Groups (c1800-c1860)*
- *Worldwide Church of God Pioneer Timelines*

Suggested reading:

- *A History of the Saturday Resurrection Doctrine* by G Dellinger
- *Research Notes on the Eastern Churches* by C White
- *Historic Church of God Fundamentals of Belief. Tracking the Development of Core Doctrines* by C White
- *History of the Seventh Day Church of God (vols 1 & 2)* by R C Nickels
- *Holy Day observances since the First Century* by C White
- *The Doctrinal Heritage of the Church of God since the Nineteenth Century* by C White
- *The Sabbath in History* by J Colheart

Introductory Remarks

Following on from various articles and charts tracing the history of Sabbatarian groups, whether the holy days have been observed over the centuries and also the fundamental beliefs of these groups from the 18th century, I thought it was high time to make an attempt to assemble the information I have on the various major doctrines of these groups.

Being truthful with history and accepting of historical facts is paramount and essential. We know that these groups kept the 10 Commandments and observed the Sabbath. In fact, honest historians declare that they (or many of them) continued to observe the holy days.¹

The doctrines of the Sabbatarian groups listed in the chart below do not include all of the obvious identifiers such as:

- 10 Commandments and Laws of God
- Sabbath
- Holy Days
- Divinity of Christ (or at least His Sonship)
- Clean and unclean foods
- Non-trinitarian
- Virgin birth of Christ
- Water baptism
- Second coming of Christ
- Millennium and the reign of the Kingdom of God on earth
- Resurrection of the righteous and sinners in separate resurrections
- Eternal Judgment
- Mortality of man and annihilation of the wicked
- Fruit of the spirit
- Beatitudes
- Repentance, faith, forgiveness and such like
- Opposition to worldly festivals such as Christmas, Easter etc
- Eldership not priesthood
- Opposition to idols and Popery
- Non-involvement in war and military service

It is difficult to ascertain how detailed their knowledge was in areas such as the Millennium, but this and other truths were taught.

At other times false doctrines would have crept in as they always do, but that does not necessarily negate them as Christians.

This research seeks to find other doctrinal positions in addition to the above such as the nature of God, born again, clean and unclean meats and observance to various other Laws (in addition to the Sabbath and Holy Days), church structure/governance/eldership, a fair chance of salvation for all and such like.

Over time, I shall fill in the gaps as I am able – given that most of my resources are in storage.

NB: not all sabbatarian groups are 'kosher' – that is true today as it was back then. Today some are virtually protestant; others almost Jewish; a few have bizarre beliefs; and there are those that are an utter disgrace as they are cultic and abusive. As we 'see through a glass darkly,' I cannot make a judgment in many cases as to which sabbatarian groups are legitimate and which I not. I merely list some of their distinctive doctrines which the mainstream did not adhere to at that time.

Chart. Doctrines of the Sabbatarians since the First Century

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
First	Early Church	All the Biblical doctrines were taught.	The emphasis would have been different it would seem to us today
Second	Polycarp	Indication was that he held to the Binitarian view of the Godhead.	
	Theophilus of Antioch	He believed in divinisation. ² Believed in a sort of Binitarianism or semi-Arianism. ³	Seemed to have been a Sabbatarian leader
	Nazarenes	Godhead doctrine – they were Binitarian ⁴ Believed the millennium and also in 3 resurrections ⁵ as well as the restoration of Israel. ⁶ "Nazarenes, an obscure Jewish-Christian sect, existing at the time of Epiphanius (fl. A.D. 370) in Coele-Syria, Decapolis (Pella) and Basanitus (Cocabe)...they dated their settlement in Pella from the time of the flight of the Jewish Christians from	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
		Jerusalem, immediately before the siege in A.D. 70;... [this writer characterizes them as] more or less than Jews pure and simple but adds that they recognized the new covenant as well as the old, and believed in the resurrection, and in the one God and His Son Jesus Christ. ...while adhering as far as possible to the Mosaic economy as regarded...sabbaths, foods , and the like, they did not refuse to recognize the apostolicity of Paul." ⁷	
Third	Nazarenes	As above	
Fourth	Nazarenes	As above	
	Ebionites	As above but also believed in circumcision, that Christ was merely human (ie adoptionism) and some had an animosity toward Paul. ⁸	Obviously they were a heretical group
Fifth	Nazarenes	As above	
Sixth	Nazarenes	As above	
Seventh	Paulicians of Armenia	A branch of the Paulician grouping in Phrygia was known as the <i>Athinganoi</i> . This group observed " observed all the laws of Moses , though refraining from circumcision on the one hand, and practicing Christian baptism on the other..." ⁹	Apparently, they were unitarians
Eighth	Paulicians of Armenia	As above	
Ninth	Paulicians of Armenia	As above	
Tenth	Paulicians of Armenia	As above	
Eleventh	Pasagini of Lombardy	"... the sect of the Pasagini. They say that Christ is the first and a pure created being and that the Old Testament is to be observed in the matter of feasts, circumcision, choice of foods , and in almost all other respects, with the exception of sacrifices" ¹⁰	This appears to be Arianism or perhaps semi-Arianism
Twelve	Pasagini of Lombardy	"The eighteenth-century Church historian [Lutheran] Mosheim mentions the Pasagini (or Pasagii) of Lombardy who were distinct on account of their teaching that the law of Moses should be kept in all details except the offering of sacrifices, and their Arian views on the nature of Christ . With regard to the former, they were sometimes known as Circumcisii since they practised	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
		circumcision. Mosheim notes that they also abstained from unclean meats prohibited by the Mosaic law." ¹¹	
Thirteenth	Pasagini	"They observed the law of Moses (except as to sacrifices), circumcision , the Sabbath, distinction of clean and unclean foods all forming part of their system...the Passagians appealed to the scriptures of the Old and New Testaments in support of their doctrine." ¹² They practiced circumcision and observed clean & unclean meats. ¹³	
Fourteenth	?		
Fifteenth	Waldenses	Equated RCC priests with Babylon, little horn of Daniel, the Great Whore of Revelation ¹⁴ NB: only a few Waldenses observed the Sabbath day ¹⁵	
Sixteenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians	Richard Nickels summarized their beliefs as such: 1) The Passover, Days of Unleavened Bread, Pentecost, Day of Atonement, Feast of Tabernacles, The Last Great Day. During the Passover season, no leavened bread was eaten. Obviously, Easter, New Year, Christmas and Sunday were rejected as days invented by Rome. They also adhered to the Sacred Calendar. 2) The Ten Commandments. 3) The Health Laws (no eating of blood, pig, strangled animals etc.) 4) The Millennium, to last 1000 years, at the beginning of which Christ will return and regather both Judah and Israel. 5) The use of God's Sacred Calendar. (Taught against Gregorian, Roman calendar.) 6) Two different Resurrections; one to eternal life at Christ's coming; the other to judgement at the end of 1000 years. 7) Saved by Grace, but laws still need to be kept. 8) It is God who calls people into His Truth. The world in general is blinded. The truth is not generally revealed to the mighty, but to the small, insignificant. 9) Christ was the greatest of the prophets, the most holy of all the people, the Crucified Lord, the Supreme Head and King of the real believers, the dearly beloved and Holy Son of God.	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
		<p>(Note! After Eossi's death, some Sabbath-keepers began to look upon Christ as a holy man, but not as the divine God or even the divine Son of God in the strictest sense.)</p> <p>10) Christ upon His return, will take over David's throne.</p> <p>11) Pictures of Christ and God were considered idolatrous.</p> <p>12) The New Covenant is only partly fulfilled now in those now called.</p> <p>13) Disbelief in the Original Sin idea.</p> <p>14) Disbelief in predestination as taught by Calvin. Instead, every person is a free moral agent.</p> <p>15) Luther, Calvin and the Pope were considered "abominations."¹⁶</p>	
Seventeenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians	<p>"Sabbatarians were easy target of the new discriminatory law: they observed the Sabbath, therefore they farmed on Sundays, abstained from eating pork and blood, celebrated the Passover with unleavened bread, and refused baptism of their children--the very sign of their expected conversion."¹⁷</p> <p>Many practised circumcision under Andreas Fischer, though another sabbatarian leader and associate, Oswald Glaidt, did not.¹⁸</p>	
	John Traske	<p>"At the same time, English Puritans were probably the first to teach that Jesus was none other than YHWH, the God of the Old Testament. Edward Stennet and John Spittlehouse called Christ Jehova Jesus in the 1650s. Anglican Francis Bampfield, a graduate of Oxford, and at one time prebend of Exeter Cathedral, wrote in his 1677 book <i>The Seventh Day Sabbath - The Desirable Day</i>, that "The LORD Jesus Christ, who is Redeemer, was Creator...Jehovah Christ as Mediator did himself at Mount Sinai proclaim the law of Ten Words." His brother, Thomas Bampfield, also held in 1692 that Jesus Christ, the Jehovah of the Old Testament, instituted the Sabbath in the beginning in <i>An enquiry whether the Lord Jesus Christ made the world, and be Jehovah, and gave the moral law? and whether the fourth command be repealed or altered?</i> Thomas had been Speaker of the House of Commons in 1659."¹⁹</p>	<p>"The example chosen is one of the most extreme and "heretical" from the early seventeenth century, that of John Traske, initially a Church of England minister, who in 1618 was imprisoned for starting a movement which ostentatiously adopted judaizing ceremonial practices...</p> <p>It would perhaps be more accurate to study the "Traskites," as they came to be known, from the perspective of the so-called "Judaizing turn" of seventeenth-century England, which was recorded a generation ago by the likes of David S.</p>

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
		<p>Traske was also opposed to eating pork and taught against it.²⁰ He subscribed to all the Levitical dietary laws forbidding the consumption of blood and swine ... the Passover [and the] Sabbath.”²¹</p> <p>“Around 1615, Traske started a one-way correspondence with the King himself, urging him to condemn “Rome and the Jesuits.”²²</p>	<p>Katz: the Hebrew revival, the eschatological hopes about locating the lost Ten Tribes of Israel and the subsequent restoration of the Jews to the land of Israel, and in the realms of philosophy and political theory, both in England and in Holland, the rise of scepticism, the consolidation of anti-trinitarianism.”²³</p> <p>The Sabbatarians at that time fell within the label of puritanism which “was a large umbrella under which many guises and incarnations may have been able to grow.”²⁴ A bit like the Churches of God today sometimes confused with Adventism.</p>
	Thomas Totney	<p>Totney was a noted Sabbatarian who believed that the Saxons were traceable back to the Biblical Israel: “The ‘Noble Saxon line,’ meanwhile, could be traced back to Biblical Israel, through:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">Media, Persian and Egypt; then into Captivity by Titus Vespasian, and so to Rome, from Rome to France in Charlemagne, from that descent to Henry the seventh.</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;">[quoting Tany, <i>Theauraujohn His Aurora</i>, 27).</p> <p>... The Saxons ... appear in the mode of Biblical Israel: noble, Godly and persecuted ... Ethnicity is grounded in ethics. Tyranny is associated with miscegenation.” (p. 183)</p> <p>Thomas Totney referred to himself “as a Jew [ie Israelite] of the tribe of Reuben” (p. 161) and he “traced his lineage back to ancient Israel.”²⁵ (p. 188)</p>	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
	Dr David Chamberlen	Believed in full water baptism (ie by immersion), footwashing and was anti-Trinity . ²⁶ Chamberlen even wrote to Archbishop Sheldon concerning "the Little Triple Crowned Horn's Change of Times and Lawes," mentioning at the same time, "Escape the Mark of the Beast: & Return to the Keeping of the Lawes of God." ²⁷	John Maulden (a Sabbatarian leader) also held to footwashing and an annual Lord's Supper (Passover). ²⁸
	Sabbatarian Church of Christ	Believed that "there is but one God the Father of whom are all things and One Lord Jesus Christ by whom are all things. And that we rely upon "God in his only begotten Son Christ Jesus for pardon & eternal life." ²⁹	Based in Westerly and Hopkinson. This seems to be an Arian belief or semi-binitarianism.
Eighteenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians	As above	
Nineteenth	Transylvanian sabbatarians	As above	
	Seventh Day Baptists	Many associated Sabbatarians believed in Arianism ³⁰ , Wednesday crucifixion ³¹ and washing of feet ³²	"I conclude they all believe in one God, the Father and Maker of all things, sin excepted, and in one Lord Jesus Christ, or that Jesus Christ is the Son of God, and also in the Holy Ghost, as the operative power or spirit of God. But there are few if any, of this denomination, as I conceive, who believe that the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost, are three absolute distinct persons, coequal, coessential, and coeternal Gods, and yet but one God ; as such an idea would be in the face of scripture, and repugnant to right reason." ³³
	Sabbatarians in West Virginia	"The Meats Issue. The doctrine of abstaining from unclean meats has long been an issue of dispute in the Church of God. A "Seventh-Day Baptist" church on the South Fork of the Hughes River in West Virginia which existed in the 1840's,	

Century	Religious Organisation or person	Doctrines	Comment
		1850's, and 1860's was looked upon as somewhat of an oddity. It termed itself "the Church of Christ," observed the Passover once a year, was governed by the elders, and forbade the use of unclean meats. ³⁴	
	Church of God	In 1866 the <i>Hope of Israel</i> periodical published an article by Brinkerhoff linking the eating of pork with the disease of trichinosis. ³⁵ RCC is Mystery Babylon, tithing, baptism, clean & unclean meats, born again in the resurrection, Wed crucifixion-Sat resurrection	Andrew N Dugger was also an exponent for the clean and unclean meats doctrine
	Greenberry G Rupert's Church group (Remnant of Israel)	Taught all the laws of God, tithing, baptism, church eras RCC is Mystery Babylon	
Twentieth	Churches of God (in general)	Tithing, baptism, clean & unclean meats, church eras, born again in the resurrection, Wed crucifixion-Sat resurrection, a resurrection of the Roman Empire etc	Pastor David Nield, for example, was residing in New Zealand when he wrote <i>Begotten Again, or Born Again – Which?</i> (1902, 15pp). He also promoted a Wednesday crucifixion and annual Passover. ³⁶

Concluding Remarks

When one views what information is available, it is clear that the stances by Sabbatarian groups on various positions changed and errors crept in. Sometimes officially and at other times 'under the radar.' For example, there have been different concepts of the Godhead by Sabbatarians. Also, one finds mention of the acceptance of circumcision from time-to-time. It is not easy to understand this: was it adult circumcision; or only for babies for hygienic reasons? On some occasions the supposed practice of circumcision was probably due to false reports by their enemies.

This does not mean that some incorrect ideas affected their salvation and we should not condemn them from our position in history. We had the blessings of the truths that came into the Church via our nineteenth century pioneers and others such as Andrew Dugger and especially Herbert W Armstrong – it is via the latter that so much greater depth was restored to the Church of God, based on the foundations he inherited.

In any event, these sabbatarian groups were part of different eras and didn't have the same depth and access to resources we have today. But they did the best they could with what they had. Today we have access to vast areas of knowledge they wouldn't have had a fraction of, such as history, archaeology, linguistics, enormous research on the tribes of Israel, chiasms, figures of speech, typology and such like which helps us in doctrinal formulation.

Knowledge is increasing in these last days – it is up to us to leverage off the good research of others while simultaneously sifting through the data and eschewing any errors found.

“But you, Daniel, shut up the words and seal the book, until the time of the end. Many shall run to and fro, and **knowledge shall increase.**”
(Daniel 12:4, ESV)

For instance, from the Church of God (seventh day) and associated groups, Herbert W Armstrong learned fundamental doctrines such as the 7th day Sabbath and basic Christian living principles (repentance, faith, fruits of the spirit, beatitudes etc). Also:

- Passover on 14 Abib
- Tithing
- Clean & unclean meats
- Millennium on earth
- Water baptism
- Holy spirit is a force, not a personage
- Wed Crucifixion-Sat Resurrection
- Man does not have an immortal soul
- Annihilation of the wicked
- The Christian reward is not heaven
- Healing
- Laying on of hands
- New birth culminates in the resurrection (the Church generally taught this into the 1940s)
- Seven resurrections of the Roman Empire (though not in much detail)
- Church eras etc (taught by Dugger and others)

Herbert Armstrong also began to observe the holy days with his wife from 1927. Other groups were already observing these days as were some individuals. It was in this context and environment that he arose and was able to undertake a vast Work where others were not able to do so.

Let us continue the tradition of digging deeper and deeper into the Truth, valuing adding and increasing to what has been restored. There is much to learn and much to gain from further research, utilising the works of specialists.

References and Additional Reading

Allix, P. (1690).	<i>Some Remarks upon the Ecclesiastical History of the Ancient churches of Piedmont</i> . Oxford at the Clarendon Press (reprint 1832).
Ambassador College (1968).	<i>Ambassador College Bible Correspondence Course</i> , Lesson 52, "The Book and the Church They Couldn't Destroy," Worldwide Church of God, Pasadena, CA.
Ball, BW (2009).	<i>Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800</i> . 2nd edition. James Clark & Co, Cambridge, UK.
Ball, BW (2015).	"The roots of English sabbatarianism." In B. Ball, & R. McIver (Eds.), <i>Grounds for assurance and hope: Selected biblical and historical writings of Bryan W. Ball</i> (pp. 142-160). Avondale Academic Press, Cooranbong, Australia.
Benson, P (c2015).	<i>Sabbatarian Churches of God in Rhode Island —Our Heritage</i> , http://www.unityinchrist.com/history/historycog1.htm
Blackwell, B C (2019).	https://dunelm.wordpress.com/2019/02/08/theophilus-of-antioch-and-theosis/ 8 Feb.
Blackwell, D (1973).	<i>A Handbook of Church History</i> . (MA thesis) Ambassador College, Pasadena, CA.
Briggs, L (1972).	<i>What Became of the Church Jesus Built?</i> Ambassador College, Pasadena, CA.
Clarke, H (1811).	<i>A History of the Sabbatarians or Seventh Day Baptists in America</i> . Seward & Williams, New York, NY.
Cook, W (2013).	"The Ebionites: Eccentric or Essential Early Christians?" <i>Journal of Arts and Humanities</i> , Vol. 2, No. 7, Aug, pp. 15-22.
Cottrell-Boyce, A. (2021).	<i>Aidan, Jewish Christians in Puritan England</i> , Wipf Publishers, Eugene, OR.
Damsteegt, P G (2016).	"Decoding Waldensian Names: New Discoveries," <i>Andrews University Seminary Studies</i> , Vol. 54, No. 2, pp. 237–258.
Dellinger, G (1982)	<i>A History of the Saturday Resurrection Doctrine</i> . Bible Research Center, Westfield, IN.
Dods, M (1885).	"Theophilus of Antioch. To Autolytus, Book II, Chapter XXII." <i>Ante-Nicene Fathers</i> , Vol 2. Edited by Alexander Roberts & James Donaldson. American Edition.
Ehrman, B D (2003).	<i>Lost Christianities: The Battle for Scriptures and Faiths We Never Knew</i> . Oxford University Press, New York, NY.
Froom, L (1954).	<i>The Prophetic Faith of Our Fathers</i> (vol. 4). Review & Herald Publishing, Washington, DC.
Gellérd, J (2000).	"Spiritual Jews of Szekler Jerusalem," <i>Literature of Memory VI: Hope and Despair</i> , STH TS 870, Fall.

Herrmann, F. (2022).	"Antinomians, Ceremonialists, and Judaizers: on the Margins of Puritanism? <i>French Journal of British Studies</i> , Vol. XXVII, No. 3, pp. 51-63.
Howard, K W (1993).	<i>Jewish Christianity in the Early Church</i> . Honors Thesis in Church History. Virginia Theological Seminary, Alexandria, VA.
Hurtado, L W (2003).	<i>Lord Jesus Christ, Devotion to Jesus in Earliest Christianity</i> . William B. Eerdmans Publishing, Grand Rapids, MI.
Liechty, D (1984).	"Andreas Fischer: A Brief Biographical Sketch," <i>The Mennonite Quarterly Review</i> , April, pp. 125-32.
Meyers, E (1988)	"Early Judaism and Christianity in the Light of Archaeology," <i>Biblical Archaeologist</i> , June 1988, pp. 69-79.
Mosheim, J L (et al) (1860).	<i>An Ecclesiastical History, Ancient and Modern</i> . Vols. 1 & 2.
Nickels, R C (1973, 1999).	<i>History of the Seventh Day Church of God</i> (Vol. 1). Giving and Sharing, St Charles, MO.
Nickels, R C (1990s).	<i>Sabbatarians in Transylvania</i> http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/transylvania.html . Giving and Sharing, St Charles, MO.
Nickels, (c2000).	<i>Sabbatarians of Transylvania</i> . Summary of the paper, <i>The Beliefs and Practices of the Church of God in Transylvania During the Middle Ages, 1588-1623</i> , by Gerhard O. Marx. http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/transylvania.html . Giving and Sharing, St Charles, MO.
NN (1997).	<i>Are the Nazarenes and Ebionites the only True Christians?</i> http://christianthinktank.com/qnazonly.html
NN (2011).	"Whatever happened to the Hebrew Christians?" <i>The Economist</i> , 20 April.
Rogers, D (1970s).	<i>The Historic Phenomena and Theology of the Nazarenes and Ebionites</i> . USA
Starr, J (1936).	"An Eastern Christian Sect: the Athinganoi," <i>The Harvard Theological Review</i> , Vol. xxix, No. 2, April, pp. 93-106.
Stump, K (1994).	"The Origins of the Church of God's Oldest Publication — The Bible Advocate," <i>Reviews You Can Use</i> , Jan-Feb, pp. 15-20.
The Encyclopedia Britannica Company (1911).	"Nazarenes," <i>The Encyclopedia Britannica</i> , Eleventh Edition, Vol. 19.
Wakefield, W L (1991).	<i>Heresies of the Middle Ages</i> . Columbia University Press, New York, NY.
Evans, A P	
Waldenses.	<i>The Book of Antichrist</i> .
Ward, S (1769).	<i>Confession of Faith</i> (5 August). Quoted in https://www.ucg.org/the-good-news/governor-samuel-ward-and-his-confession-of-faith
White, W (2008).	<i>The Roots of Our Belief</i> . Dynamic Christian Ministries, USA.
Wikipedia (2019).	<i>Collectio Rev. Occitan</i> in the Royal Library of Paris, doc. 35, quoted in Dollingers' <i>History of the Sects</i> , Vol. 2, p. 375. (Quoted in https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians)
Wikipedia (2019).	"Pasagians" https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians
White, A L (1965).	<i>Ellen G. White Estate – Question and Answer File</i> . 13 May, Ellen G. White Publications.
Hook, M (c.1980).	<i>Sequel to a Mutiny Early Adventism on Pitcairn Island</i> . South Pacific Division Department of Education, Wahroonga, Australia.

Endnotes

¹ “Whatever happened to the Hebrew Christians?” *The Economist*, 20 April 2011.

² B Blackwell, <https://dunelm.wordpress.com/2019/02/08/theophilus-of-antioch-and-theosis/>

³ “Theophilus of Antioch. To Autolycus, Book II, Chapter XXII.” Translated by Marcus Dods, A.M. Excerpted from *Ante-Nicene Fathers*, Vol. 2, 1885.

⁴ “... “Nazarene” Christianity [Sabbatarians and adherers to the Law], had a view of Jesus fully compatible with the beliefs favored by the proto-orthodox (indeed, they could be considered part of the circles that made up proto-orthodox Christianity of the time). Pritz contended that this **Nazarene Christianity was the dominant form of Christianity in the first and second centuries** ... the devotional stance toward Jesus that characterized most of the Jewish Christians of the first and second centuries seems to have been congruent with proto-orthodox devotion to Jesus ... **the proto-orthodox “binitarian” pattern of devotion**” (LW Hurtado, *Lord Jesus Christ, Devotion to Jesus in Earliest Christianity*, pp. 560-61, 618).

As such, they did not view the holy spirit as a personage. One author explains it in this fashion:

“The Nazarene doctrine of the Holy Spirit, though it may have been somewhat primitive and underdeveloped, was not heretical. Even the greater Church’s doctrine of the Holy Spirit took significantly longer than the other doctrines to develop not reaching its final form until the fourth or fifth century. That the Nazarene doctrine of the Holy Spirit might have been somewhat primitive compared to that of the greater Church would not be unexpected. The increasing isolation of the Nazarenes would have cut them off from the deliberations and decisions of the greater Church on this issue, accounting for the retarded development of this doctrine among the Nazarenes.” (K Howard, *Excommunicating the Faithful. Jewish Christianity in the Early Church*, footnote 417)

This shows that both Sabbatarians and the neo-Catholic groups did not adhere to the trinitarian formula at that time – it came into Christianity gradually.

Further information on the Nazarene’s binitarian belief can be found in the article *Are the Nazarenes and Ebionites the only True Christians?*

⁵ Belief in three (instead of two) resurrections is virtually unheard of in Christian theology. However, history records that some Sabbatarians believed in three resurrections in the 2nd century:

“These Jewish Christian groups, referred to by Epiphanius (Williams, 1987) as Nazarenes or Elkasaites, professed the following beliefs: They proclaimed Jesus as prophet-Messiah; insisted upon the validity of the Torah & laws of ritual purity; **spoke of three resurrections**; professed a **millennarian eschatology**; looked forward to the restoration of the Temple; observed the feast of Sukkoth (Tabernacles), celebrated Easter at Passover, & observed the Sabbath; affirmed the primacy of James, brother of Jesus, over Peter in the leadership of the church; & preferred the

designation “Nazarene” over “Christian.” (E Meyers, “Early Judaism and Christianity in the Light of Archaeology,” *Biblical Archaeologist*, June 1988, p. 71) [emphasis mine]

If it is indeed true that the Nazarenes are our spiritual ancestors (Acts 24:5), it would appear from the above quote that they believed in 3 resurrections. One can assume that they believed in three resurrections in similitude to what the old Worldwide Church of God taught (viz 1st resurrection of the saints; 2nd resurrection of the majority of mankind who were not ‘called’ to salvation in this life; 3rd resurrection to eternal death of the wicked). Alternatively, they may have meant that Christ’s resurrection was the 1st, the resurrection of the saints was the 2nd and the resurrection at the end of the millennium was the 3rd. More investigation is required in this regard to ascertain with certainty exactly what they believed pertaining to the 3rd resurrection. It may be more than passing interest that there were:

- 3 resurrections performed in the Old Testament (IKings 17:17-25; IIKings 4:32-37; 13:20-21);
- 3 by Christ (Luke 7:11-18; Mark 5:35; John 11); and
- 3 after Christ’s death (Matt 27:51-53; Acts 9:36-43; 20:7-16).

⁶ D Rogers, *The Historic Phenomena and Theology of the Nazarenes and Ebionites*, p. 14.

⁷ “Nazarenes,” *The Encyclopaedia Britannica*, Eleventh Edition, Vol. 19.

⁸ W Cook, “The Ebionites: Eccentric or Essential Early Christians?” *Journal of Arts and Humanities*, Vol. 2, No. 7, August 2013, pp. 15-22.

⁹ J Starr, “An Eastern Christian Sect: the Athinganoi,” *The Harvard Theological Review*, Vol. xxix, No. 2, April 1936, p. 96.

¹⁰ W Wakefield, *Heresies of the High Middle Ages*, p. 175.

¹¹ B Ball, “The roots of English sabbatarianism.” In B. Ball, & R. McIver (Eds.), *Grounds for assurance and hope: Selected biblical and historical writings of Bryan W. Ball*, pp. 147-48. See Mosheim (et al) *An Ecclesiastical History*, p. 333.

¹² Blunt’s *Dictionary of Sects and Heresies*, quoted in Blackwell, *A Handbook of Church History*, pp. 115-116.

¹³ *Collectio Rev. Occitan* in the Royal Library of Paris, doc. 35, quoted in Dollingers’ *History of the Sects*, Vol. 2, p. 375

“After what has been said of the Cathari, there still remains the sect of the Pasagini. **They teach Christ to be the first and pure creature; that the Old Testament festivals are to be observed-- circumcision, distinction of foods**, and in nearly all other matters, save the sacrifices, the Old Testament is to be observed as literally as the New--circumcision is to be kept according to the letter.” (*Collectio Rev. Occitan* in the Royal Library of Paris, doc. 35, quoted in Dollingers’ *History of the Sects*, Vol. 2 p. 375 quoted in <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians>).

Also, “The Pasagians, also spelled Passagians or Pasagini, were a religious sect which appeared in Lombardy in the late 12th or early 13th century and possibly appearing much earlier in the East. The Summa contra haereticos, ascribed to Praepositinus of Cremona, describes the Pasagians as retaining the Old Testament rules on circumcision, **kosher foods, and the Jewish holy days; in other words, they observed the Law of Moses except in respect to sacrifices**, and thus also were given the name Circumcisi.”

(Blunt, John Henry (1874). *Dictionary of Sects, Heresies, Ecclesiastical Parties and Schools of Religious Thought*. London, Oxford and Cambridge: Rivingtons, pp. 408-09. quoted in <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Pasagians>).

Of these, Johann Lorenz Mosheim has written the following:

"Like the other sects already mentioned, they had the utmost aversion to the dominion and discipline of the church of Rome; but they were, at the same time, distinguished by two religious tenets, which were peculiar to themselves. The first was a notion that the observation of the law of Moses, in everything except the offering of sacrifices, was obligatory upon Christians, in consequence of which they circumcised their followers, abstained from those meats, the use of which was prohibited under the Mosaic economy, and celebrated the Jewish Sabbath" (*Ecclesiastical History*, Vol. 2, p. 273, 1860 edition).

¹⁴ *The Book of Antichrist*.

¹⁵ P Damsteegt, "Decoding Waldensian Names: New Discoveries," *Andrews University Seminary Studies*, Vol. 54, No. 2, 2016, pp. 252-57.

Peter Allix, wrote about the doctrines of some of the Waldensians based on a critic of theirs:

"That the Law of Moses is to be kept according to the letter, and that the keeping of the Sabbath, Circumcision, **and other legal observances**, ought to take place. They hold also, **that Christ the Son of God is not equal with the Father, and that the Father, Son, and Holy Ghost, these three Persons, are not one God** and one substance; and, as a surplus to these their errors, -they judge and condemn all the doctors of the Church, and universally the whole Roman Church. Now, since they endeavour to defend this their error by testimonies drawn from the New Testament and Prophets, I shall, with assistance of the grace of Christ, stop their mouths, as David did Goliath's, with their own sword. (*Some Remarks upon the Ecclesiastical History of the Ancient churches of Piedmont*, p. 169)

¹⁶ <http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/transylvania.html>

After he died, Eossi's adopted son, Simon Pechi, took over the movement it is reported that 20,000 Hungarians to the faith until a crackdown occurred and many fled, left the faith or converted to Judaism. Legislation was passed in 1595 and 1618 decreeing death or loss of property for all Judaizers.

¹⁷ J Gellerd, "Spiritual Jews of Szekler Jerusalem," *Literature of Memory VI: Hope and Despair*, STH TS 870, Fall, p. 2.

Mention is made of these East European sabbatarians in the *Ambassador College Bible Correspondence Course*, lesson 52, pp. 12-13.

¹⁸ D Liechty, "Andreas Fischer: A Brief Biographical Sketch," *The Mennonite Quarterly Review*, April 1984, pp. 131-32.

¹⁹ W White, *The Roots of Our Belief*. Dynamic Christian Ministries, USA, 2008, pp. 6-7. His source is probably Leon Lyell's article "The Seventh Day Men," *The Sabbath Sentinel*, July-Aug (2000), pp. 13-16.

²⁰ B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, p. 94.

²¹ F Herrmann, "Antinomians, Ceremonialists, and Judaizers: on the Margins of Puritanism?" *French Journal of British Studies*, Vol. XXVII, No. 3, 2022, p 53.

²² F Herrmann, *ibid*, p. 53.

²³ F Herrmann, *ibid*, pp. 52, 57.

²⁴ F Herrmann, *ibid*, p. 57.

²⁵ Aidan Cottrell-Boyce, *Jewish Christians in Puritan England*, pp. 183, 188.

²⁶ B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, pp. 89-91.

²⁷ L Froom, *The Prophetic Faith of Our Fathers*, Vol. 4, p. 913.

²⁸ B Ball, *Seventh Day Men: Sabbatarians and Sabbatarianism in England and Wales, 1600-1800*, p. 89.

²⁹ *Confession of Faith* by Samuel Ward (5 August 1769) quoted in <https://www.ucg.org/the-good-news/governor-samuel-ward-and-his-confession-of-faith>

³⁰ L Briggs, *What Became of the Church Jesus Built?* p. 206.

³¹ G Dellinger, *A History of the Saturday Resurrection Doctrine*, pp. 11-12.

³² L Briggs, *What Became of the Church Jesus Built?* p. 206.

³³ H Clarke, *A History of the Sabbatarians or Seventh Day Baptists in America*, p. 62.

³⁴ R Nickels, *History of the Seventh Day Church of God* (Vol. 1), p. 187.

³⁵ K Stump, "The Origins of the Church of God's Oldest Publication — The Bible Advocate," *Reviews You Can Use*, Jan-Feb 1994, p. 18.

³⁶ "I find in our files that there was a critical minister, a David Niels said to be the pastor of the Church of God at Devonport, Halloway, London North, England, Auckland and Wellington, New Zealand, author of the Good Friday Problem which proves that Christ died on Wednesday and rose on Saturday" (*Ellen G. White Estate – Question and Answer File*, 13 May, 1965, p.1, by Arthur L. White, Secretary, Ellen G. White Publications).

"Niels was known as a pastor of the Church of God and not sympathetic to the Adventist cause. He held such beliefs as a Wednesday crucifixion of Christ, the continuing necessity to celebrate the Passover He challenged the Pitcairners to give up Adventism and accept his teachings as his wife had done. Instead, the islanders refused and despatched an urgent request to Australia for a resident Adventist missionary." (*Sequel to a Mutiny Early Adventism on Pitcairn Island*, By Milton Hook, South Pacific Division Department of Education, Wairoa, c.1980, p. 16).

“From its low ebb the fervour on Pitcairn soared to a high peak during those eight months of 1924. News then came to hand that Nield had died in New Zealand and the Hares left Pitcairn on October 23.” (p. 17).

[emphasis mine for all references above]